

Portrayal of Women in Elite Press of Pakistan and United States

Zahid Yousaf

Centre for Media and Communication Studies, University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Pakistan

Abstract: The study is focused to analyze the portrayal of the women in the elite press of Pakistan and the United States in the elite press of Pakistan and the United States, in this study it is tried to analyze how the press of both countries has portrayed the women related issues in the front and back pages from January 2013 to March 2013. Four newspapers are selected for the study two Daily Dawn and The Nation from Pakistan and two New York Times and Washington Post from United States. The framing theory is used to check that how the press has framed the issues and covered the women related news and the content analysis method is used to analyze the contents of the news. The results shows by comparing the news in both front and back pages of the newspapers we come to know that the number of news related to women on the front page in Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn are 105, in The Nation 99 whereas the news published in the US newspapers New York Times are 84 and 79 news in Washington Post. This shows that the Pakistani press has given more coverage than the United States press.

Key words: Portrayal • Female • Pakistan • US • Press • Framing

INTRODUCTION

We are living in the 21st century and it is a heart-throbbing fact that still most of the sections of the society do not realize the importance of women in the socio-economic fabric. It would be deplorable if the status and the role of women were not appropriately perceived, since women are a part of society and share work and responsibility. Therefore, it is indispensable to address the depiction of women and to strengthen the informational role of the media regarding women. Butt and Mourion [1] says that media are one of the modern ways to maintain and promote ideology and to relate it to the national needs, but also adds that to do this promotion, a grand number of projects and actions are required constantly by the state and the people as well. In an Islamic society, the press should conform to the Islamic laws and moral values while obscenity should be strictly forbidden even for a single person. Unfortunately, the condition of Pakistani press in terms of this connection is not good. The press is projecting women in a totally un-Islamic way. As such newspapers, magazines and advertisements are three major sources of spreading obscenity in news, western style, trends and personalities

are being highlighted quite indecently. The news about scandals, rapes, pregnancy, fashion shows, show-biz and private matters of wife and husband are being over played. The photographs related to these news are nude and below the standards of morality. Sexual crimes are being highlighted in which women are badly humiliated.

In view of Diana [2] females make up 51 percent of the U.S. population; there are business, societal and cultural imperatives that demand gender equality and equal participation. According to a report by Robin and Craig [3] the Women's Media Center has provided dismaying statistical data on the status of women in American media. The report draws attention to the striking underrepresentation of women who determine the content of news, literature and television and film entertainment, as well as the negative portrayal of women in entertainment television and film. As a consequence, the role of women has had major societal effects, including gender inequity.

Habib [4] observed that in Pakistan media in general are said to present women exclusively in the stereotyped roles of house wives, mother and consumer of advertised goods, while as far as development is concerned, women very rarely speak for their own problems. Costello [5]

points out three main aspects of the media which women's groups tend to be concerned with images of women in the media: TV, cinema and videos frequently show stereotyped and narrow images of women's position and role in society.

Smith [6] regarding advertising in print media said that the results of more than a dozen studies, almost all conducted in the 1970s, have shown the messages of advertising to be astonishingly similar; Woman's place is in the home; women are dependent upon men; women do not make independent and important decision; women are shown in few occupational roles; women view themselves and are viewed by others as sex objects. Latif [7] concludes that the role of newspapers is not satisfactory regarding the development plans and projects for women. The publicity of such projects has always been secondary importance in the priorities of these newspapers. Instead of creative and constructive development news media projects political statements, issues, crime and sports in its contents. "Media Report to Women" Editor Gibbons [8] says that Women's pages were dropped from most of the newspapers in the early 1970s, but were reintroduced to attract readership. This shows that women news is used as bait to attract readers not for raising a voice for their rights. Gibbons [9] in her latest study of women in journalism found that women continue to be the far-second sex in breaking and making news. After studying the contents of radio, television and newspaper for a full day in 76 countries, on the same day, she commented that women were underrepresented and sometimes outright ignored, as subjects of and sources for news, regardless of the medium. There is not a single major news topic in which women outnumber men as newsmakers. She adds that even the stories like gender-based violence, those effect women intensely; it is the male voice that prevails. This report reveals that the second-class status of women is prevailing grossly and globally. Creedon and Cramer [10] says women have not received power and influence that mirrors their numbers in newsrooms and companies. They are under represented in management, where they hold a quarter of the jobs. Fewer women of color are news executives or editors. The authors further added that the women in newspapers face barriers to advancement, work-family balance issues and a lack of mentors, role models and professional development opportunities.

Hearn and Parkin [11] says theory is an interrelated set of propositions, although some theories consist of a single proposition. Theory is an attempt to explain a particular phenomenon. The theory used for the present study is framing theory.

Framing Theory: The term framing means how to portray an event in particular news story, articles, features or editorials. Display and placement of news stories and other journalistic contents depend on many factors i.e. geographical, proximity, personalities, time lines and magnitude. McQuail [12] is of the view that "Persistent Patterns of Cognition" interpretation and presentation of selection, emphasis and exclusion, by which symbol handlers routinely organize discourse, whether verbal or visual". He further says that, the Framing of an issue is influenced by which of many bits of information, included or excluded from a story. In his words "*media are mobile lights, not passive mirrors of the society, selectivity is the instrument of their action.*" In this study the framing of the women in the elite press of Pakistan and America will be analyzed that how the elite press of both the states analyze the portrayal of the women while covering the issues related to women.

Objectives of the Study:

- To determine whether or not the press is providing positive coverage to women.
- To examine the quality of the women related news published in Elite press of Pakistan and America.
- To find out the issues related to women that are frequently discussed and whether the issues discussed are basic or not.

MATERIALS AND METHODOS

The study is aimed at analyzing portrayal of women's image in press. The researcher followed the following procedures, Content analysis is a formal system for doing something that we all do informally rather frequently, drawing conclusions from observations of content. It is a research technique for making inferences by systematically and objectively identifying specified characteristics within a text. Krippendorff [13] added that results of content analysis should be predictive of something that is, in theory, observable, or aid in conceptualizing reality.

Universe of the Study: The universe of the present study is the elite press of Pakistan and America that is "Dawn and The Nation" from Pakistan and "New York Times and Washington Post" from America.

Sample Size: The total number of women related news published in the front and back pages of the selected

newspapers during the months of January 2013 to March 2013 are the sample size. Krippendorff [13] defined content analysis “as a research technique for making replicable and valid references from data to their context.” Kerlinger [14] defined content analysis “as a method of studying and analyzing communication in a systematic, objective and quantitative manner for the purpose of measuring variables”. According to McQuail [12], content analysis enables predictions to be made about the communication process. It is used with other methods of inquiry to line message content with other parts of the communication setting. It allows the investigator to deal with larger questions of the process and effect of communication. The Qualitative and Quantitative analyses both are used for this study. In qualitative analysis the study of quality of the content is the main consideration. In content analysis the purpose is to know the number or frequency of similar contents.

Selection of the Categories: The category system best suited and workable for the study was used. While constructing the categories the following linkages lay down by Stempel [15] a) Categories must be pertinent to the objectives of the study, b) Categories should be functional and c) The system of categories must be manageable

Keeping in view the above principles and to adequately meet with the study’s objectives an exclusive and exhaustive categories were developed. In these four selected newspapers, major news items related to women were divided into five categories.

Category A represents “Occurrence News”
Category B represents “Ceremonial news”
Category C represents “Investigative news”
Category D represents “Women captions”
Category E represents “Miscellaneous”
All these topics were defined as follows

Occurrence News: All news based on happenings i.e. Honor killings, kidnapping, murder, robbery, suicides etc. Comments, articles write-ups on occurrences are also placed in this category because if there is no occurrence, there will be no news and no comments.

Ceremonial News: Report of ceremonial activities i.e. seminars, conferences, inaugurations, tape cuttings, observance of special days etc. are the ceremonial news. The follow ups by way of editorials, columns, articles are also placed in the same category. Such news results from

ceremonies generally attended by celebrities. The celebrities “are the news pegs in such stories”.

Investigative News: The news dug out by the reporter fall under these categories. Corruption scandals, misappropriations, irregularities and other misdeeds sometime are published as exclusive investigative news. Sometime features etc. are also written in the same way.

Women Caption: Only photographs of women without any news items.

Miscellaneous: The news items not falling under above categories are termed as miscellaneous. In fact such news fall in one of the above four categories, but they get special treatment due to certain factors. The jumping of a poor widow in a canal is an occurrence, but the cause of jumping i.e. nothing to feed the children makes this occurrence special miscellaneous news. Similarly an odd feature on a girl orphanage also falls under this category.

Direction of the Contents: To measure the direction of the contents of the Dawn, The Nation, Washington Post and New York Times Burleson’s method of totality of impression is used. This totality of impression is used to determine the “direction” or orientation of the communication related to Framing. In the present study the date was ranked on a three-point scale.

Supportive/Favorable/Positive	(+)
Opposite/Unfavorable/Negative	(-)
Neutral	(0)

Hypotheses:

- The Elite press of Pakistan is portraying women mainly negatively.
- The Elite press of America is portraying women mainly positively.
- The Elite press of America gives more coverage regarding women related issues than Pakistani press.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Front Page: Table 1 represents category “A” i.e. Occurrence news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 39 news regarding this category where 12 news are positive, 17 are negative whereas 10 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 30 news regarding this category where 9 news

Table 1:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	39	12	17	10
Nation	30	9	15	6
New York Times	20	3	5	12
Washington Post	23	6	3	14

Occurrence News

Table 2:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	21	14	2	5
Nation	28	17	3	8
New York Times	38	24	2	12
Washington Post	19	11	1	7

Ceremonial News

Table 3:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	16	3	4	9
Nation	23	5	2	16
New York Times	12	6	1	5
Washington Post	21	9	0	12

Investigative News

are positive, 15 are negative whereas 10 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 20 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 5 are negative whereas 12 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 23 news regarding this category where 6 news are positive, 3 are negative whereas 14 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 2 represents category i.e. Ceremonial news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 21 news regarding this category where 14 news are positive, 2 are negative whereas 5 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 28 news regarding this category where 17 news are positive, 3 are negative whereas 8 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 38 news regarding this category where 24 news are positive, 2 are negative whereas 12 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 19 news regarding this category where 11 news are positive, 1 are negative whereas 7 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 3 represents category i.e. Investigative news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 16 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 4 are negative whereas 8 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 23 news regarding

Table 4:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	8	3	1	4
Nation	5	1	0	4
New York Times	6	4	0	2
Washington Post	4	3	0	1

Women Captions

Table 5:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	21	6	10	5
Nation	13	2	7	4
New York Times	9	3	1	5
Washington Post	12	1	3	8

Miscellaneous

this category where 5 news, are positive, 2 are negative whereas 16 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 12 news regarding this category where 16 news are positive, 1 are negative whereas 5 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 7 news regarding this category where 1 news are positive, 3 are negative whereas 8 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 4 represents category i.e. Women captions, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 8 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 1 are negative whereas 4 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 5 news regarding this category where 1 news is positive, 0 are negative whereas 4 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 6 news regarding this category where 4 news are positive, 0 are negative whereas 2 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 4 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 0 are negative whereas 1 is showing neutral behavior.

Table 5 represents category i.e. Miscellaneous news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 21 news regarding this category where 6 news are positive, 10 are negative whereas 5 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 4 news regarding this category where 2 news, are positive, 7 are negative whereas 10 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 9 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 1 are negative whereas 5 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 12 news regarding this category where 1 news are positive, 3 are negative whereas 8 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 6:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	43	6	15	22
Nation	31	9	10	12
New York Times	28	9	5	13
Washington Post	38	13	7	18

Occurrence News

Table 7:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	37	19	5	16
Nation	51	22	10	19
New York Times	35	15	7	13
Washington Post	33	12	9	12

Ceremonial News

Table 8:

	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	19	6	9	4
Nation	28	14	3	10
New York Times	16	5	2	9
Washington Post	14	6	4	4

Investigative News

Back Page: Table 6 represents category “A” i.e. Occurrence News, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 43 news regarding this category where 6 news are positive, 15 are negative whereas 22 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 31 news regarding this category where 9 news are positive, 10 are negative whereas 12 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 28 news regarding this category where 9 news are positive, 5 are negative whereas 13 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 38 news regarding this category where 13 news are positive, 7 are negative whereas 18 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 7 represents category “B” i.e. Ceremonial news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 37 news regarding this category where 19 news are positive, 5 are negative whereas 16 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 51 news regarding this category where 22 news are positive, 10 are negative whereas 19 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 35 news regarding this category where 15 news are positive, 7 are negative whereas 13 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 33 news regarding this category where 12 news are positive, 9 are negative whereas 12 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 9:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	7	1	2	4
Nation	4	2	0	2
New York Times	3	2	0	1
Washington Post	5	3	0	2

Women Captions

Table 10:

Newspaper	Total	Positive	Negative	Neutral
Dawn	59	23	17	19
Nation	42	19	9	13
New York Times	58	29	10	18
Washington Post	39	11	11	16

Miscellaneous

Table 8 represents category “C” i.e. Investigative news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 19 news regarding this category where 6 news are positive, 9 are negative whereas 4 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 28 news regarding this category where 14 news are positive, 3 are negative whereas 10 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 16 news regarding this category where 5 news are positive, 2 are negative whereas 9 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 14 news regarding this category where 6 news are positive, 4 are negative whereas 4 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 9 represents category “D” i.e. Women captions, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 7 news regarding this category where 1 news are positive, 2 are negative whereas 4 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 4 news regarding this category where 2 news are positive, 0 are negative whereas 2 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 3 news regarding this category where 2 news are positive, 0 are negative whereas 1 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 5 news regarding this category where 3 news are positive, 0 are negative whereas 2 are showing neutral behavior.

Table 10 represents category “E” i.e. Miscellaneous news, table shows that Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn has given total 59 news regarding this category where 23 news are positive, 17 are negative whereas 19 are showing neutral behavior. The Nation has given total 42 news regarding this category where 19 news, are positive, 9 are negative whereas 13 are showing neutral behavior. The US newspaper New York Times has given total 58 news

regarding this category where 29 news, are positive, 10 are negative whereas 18 are showing neutral behavior and Washington Post has given total 39 news regarding this category where 11 news are positive, 11 are negative whereas 16 are showing neutral behavior.

By comparing the news in both front and back pages of the newspapers we come to know that the number of news related to women on the front page in Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn are 105, in The Nation 99 whereas the news published in the US newspapers New York Times are 84 and 79 news in Washington Post. The news in Daily Dawn related to category "A" are 39 out of which 12 are positive, 17 are negative whereas 10 are neutral news, in category "B" are 21 out of which 14 are positive, 2 are negative whereas 5 are neutral news, in category "C" are 16 out of which 3 are positive, 4 are negative whereas 9 are neutral news, in category "D" are 8 out of which 3 are positive, 1 is negative whereas 4 are neutral news and in category "E" are 21 out of which 6 are positive, 10 are negative whereas 5 are neutral news.

The news in The Nation related to category "A" are 30 out of which 9 are positive, 15 are negative whereas 6 are neutral news, in category "B" are 28 out of which 17 are positive, 3 are negative whereas 8 are neutral news, in category "C" are 23 out of which 5 are positive, 2 are negative whereas 16 are neutral news, in category "D" are 5 out of which 1 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 4 are neutral news and in category "E" are 13 out of which 2 are positive, 7 are negative whereas 4 are neutral news.

The news in the US newspapers New York Times related to category "A" are 19 out of which 3 are positive, 5 are negative whereas 11 are neutral news, in category "B" are 38 out of which 24 are positive, 2 are negative whereas 12 are neutral news, in category "C" are 12 out of which 6 are positive, 1 are negative whereas 5 are neutral news, in category "D" are 6 out of which 4 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 2 are neutral news and in category "E" are 9 out of which 3 are positive, 1 are negative whereas 5 are neutral news.

The news in Washington Post related to category "A" are 23 out of which 6 are positive, 3 are negative whereas 14 are neutral news, in category "B" are 19 out of which 11 are positive, 1 is negative whereas 7 are neutral news, in category "C" are 21 out of which 9 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 12 are neutral news, in category "D" are 4 out of which 3 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 1 are neutral news and in category "E" are 12 out of which 1 are positive, 3 are negative whereas 8 are neutral news.

The total news of all categories in Front Page are 367 out of which 111 are in category A, 106 in category B, 72 in category C, 23 in category D and 55 in category E.

The number of news related to women on the Back page in Pakistani newspapers Daily Dawn are 165, in The Nation 154 whereas the news published in the US newspapers New York Times are 138 and 129 news in Washington Post. The news in Daily Dawn related to category "A" are 43 out of which 6 are positive, 15 are negative whereas 22 are neutral news, in category "B" are 37 out of which 19 are positive, 5 are negative whereas 16 are neutral news, in category "C" are 19 out of which 6 are positive, 9 are negative whereas 4 are neutral news, in category "D" are 7 out of which 1 are positive, 2 are negative whereas 4 are neutral news and in category "E" are 59 out of which 23 are positive, 17 are negative whereas 19 are neutral news.

The news in The Nation related to category "A" are 31 out of which 9 are positive, 10 are negative whereas 12 are neutral news, in category "B" are 51 out of which 22 are positive, 10 are negative whereas 19 are neutral news, in category "C" are 27 out of which 14 are positive, 3 are negative whereas 10 are neutral news, in category "D" are 4 out of which 2 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 2 are neutral news and in category "E" are 41 out of which 19 are positive, 9 are negative whereas 13 are neutral news.

The news in the US newspapers New York Times related to category "A" are 27 out of which 9 are positive, 5 are negative whereas 13 are neutral news, in category "B" are 35 out of which 15 are positive, 7 are negative whereas 13 are neutral news, in category "C" are 16 out of which 5 are positive, 2 are negative whereas 9 are neutral news, in category "D" are 3 out of which 2 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 1 are neutral news and in category "E" are 57 out of which 29 are positive, 10 are negative whereas 18 are neutral news.

The news in Washington Post related to category "A" are 38 out of which 13 are positive, 7 are negative whereas 18 are neutral news, in category "B" are 33 out of which 12 are positive, 9 is negative whereas 12 are neutral news, in category "C" are 14 out of which 6 are positive, 4 is negative whereas 4 are neutral news, in category "D" are 5 out of which 3 are positive, 0 is negative whereas 2 are neutral news and in category "E" are 39 out of which 11 are positive, 12 are negative whereas 16 are neutral news.

The total news of all categories in Back Page are 586 out of which 139 are in category A, 156 in category B, 76 in category C, 19 in category D and 196 in category E.

By comparing the news in both front and back pages we come to know that on the front page there are 367 total news related to women whereas 586 are on back pages. There is more number of news on back page then on the front page, similarly by comparing the categories of both

the front and back pages there are that on the front page there are 111 news in category A, 106 in category B, 72 in category C, 23 in category D whereas 55 in category E. On the back page there are 139 news in category A, 156 in category B, 76 in category C, 19 in category D whereas 196 in category E. By comparing the categories there are more news in back page than the front page in almost all the categories except category D where there are more news in front page than the back page. The results mentioned above shows that in all the categories there are more number of news given in both Pakistani newspapers than both the U.S. newspapers. So, we can conclude that Pakistani press has given more coverage to the women related news than the U.S. newspapers.

REFERENCES

1. Butt, A.G. and Mourion, 1996. Portrayal of Women in the Communication Media, Lahore: Pakistan Women's Institute.
2. Diana, M.K., 2013. The Status of Women in the U. S. Media 2013, Women's media center, U.S.
3. Robin, H., Y. Pugh and T.C. Dearfield, 2012. The Status of Women in the U.S. Media 2012, Women's media center, U.S.
4. Habib, M., 1975. Women and the Media in Pakistan, Paper presented at International Women's year Seminar, Islamabad.
5. Costello, K., 1997. Demand Better Portrayal of Women, Vol 3 Issue 1, February 1997.
6. Smith, L.L., 1989. Advertising Women's Place and Image: Women in Mass Communication challenging Gender Values, California: Sage Publications.
7. Latif, F., 1998. Media strategies for Islamic Feminist Theory. Unpublished M.Phil Thesis, Lahore: Department of Mass Communication University of the Punjab, Lahore.
8. Gibbons, S., 1998. Women's Pages Being Reintroduced to Attract Readers, Media Report to Women, 26(4), Fall 1998-B.
9. Gibbons, S., 2006. Women's Lowly News Status Is a Global Insult? Women News, Run Date: 02/22/06, <http://www.womensenews.org/article.cfm?aid=2646>, Retrieved on 19th July, 2006.
10. Creedon, P.J. and J. Cramer, 2007. Women in Mass Communication, (3rd ed.) London: Sage Publications
11. Hearn, J. and W. Parkin, 1993. Organizations, Multiple Oppressions and Post-Modernism, London: Sage Publications.
12. McQuail, D., 1987. Mass Communication Theory: An Introduction, London: Sage Publications.
13. Krippendorff, K., 1980. Content Analysis-An Introduction to its Methodology, London: Sage Publication.
14. Kerlinger, F.N., 1973. Foundations of Behavioral Research, (2nd ed) New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc.
15. Stemple, G.A., 1955. Increasing Reliability in Content Analysis, Journalism Quarterly, Fall, 1955.